COMPARATIVE AND 'DIVERSITY LINGUISTICS'

WHERE NEXT?



Paul Heggarty

Linguistics, Max Planck Institute for Evolutionary Anthropology, Leipzig

Paul.Heggarty@gmail.com — http://eva-mpg.academia.edu/PaulHeggarty

A WIND OF CHANGE?



SIGN OF THE TIMES?

Dept of Linguistics

Bernard Comrie, (typological) linguist



... interested in "language universals" ... and "language typology". Why are language universals and cross-linguistic variation the way they are? Various phenomena are studied across a wide range of languages ... field work is an important tool...

Dept of Linguistic and Cultural Evolution

Russell Gray, "evolutionist"



... bring together biologists, linguists and social scientists to apply cutting-edge ... computational advances from the natural sciences while still maintaining the highest standards of scholarship from the humanities ...
 [to resolve] long-standing questions about human history that were previously deemed difficult, or

even completely intractable.

ILL WIND — OR BREATH OF FRESH AIR?

- Linguistics being outdone even led? by other disciplines?
- Led ... by non-linguistic tools and models:
 From biological or mathematical sciences.
 - Unsuited to language?
- Led ... in which direction?
- Change of focus, even of whole objective?
 - Language for language's sake ...
 - \rightarrow Language for human (pre)history.



BE NOT AFRAID!



LINGUISTS, MEET NUMBERS ...

- Change in methods: numbers. But ...
 - You can't get good numbers without the qualitative analysis.
 - Typological and universal tendencies also need quantitative answers.

How DID IT COME TO THIS?

- Make the news. Get the funding. Call the shots.
- Old question
 hot news.
- Linguistics began with a question posed in ... 1786.
- Still no answer!
- Huge new advances ... from *outside* linguistics.



ANATOLIAN THEORY 8,500 to 9,000

years ago

Science

Daily News



JUG WITH BROAD HANDLE AND INS ICED DECORATIONWERNER FROM AN ARCHIVE/BRIDGEMAN IMAGES The creators of the Corded Ware culture, named after this intricate pottery, may have spoken an Indo-European language derived from one spoken by herders from the East.

Mysterious Indo-European homeland may have been in the steppes of Ukraine and Russia



🖂 Email Michael

By Michael Balter 13 February 2015 2:15 pm 77 Comments

What do you call a male sibling? If you speak English, he is your "brother." Greek? Call him "phrater." Sanskrit, Latin, Old Irish? "Bhrater," "frater," or "brathir," respectively. Ever since the mid-17th century, scholars have noted such similarities among the so-called Indo-European languages, which span the world and number more than 400 if dialects are included. Researchers agree that they can probably all be traced back to one ancestral language, called Proto-Indo-European (PIE). But for nearly 20 years, scholars have debated vehemently when and where PIE arose.

Two long-awaited studies, one described online this week in a preprint and another scheduled

nature International weekly journal of science

NATURE | NEWS

Enter Search Term

 \times

Steppe migration rekindles debate on language origin

Eurasian region gains ground as birthplace of Indo-European tongues.

Ewen Callaway

18 February 2015

STEPPE IN TIME

An ancient-DNA study links the Corded Ware culture of northern Europe with the Yamnaya culture of the Eurasian steppe. It points to a mass migration northwest that would support the Steppe hypothesis, one of two theories that compete to explain the origins of the Indo-European family of languages.



nature International weekly journal of science

Wolfgang Haak, Iosif Lazaridis, Nick Patterson, Nadin Rohland, Swapan Mallick, Bastien Llamas, Guido Brandt, Susanne Nordenfelt, Eadaoin Harney, Kristin Stewardson, Qiaomei Fu, Alissa Mittnik, Eszter Bánffy, Christos Economou, Michael Francken, Susanne Friederich, Rafael Garrido Pena, Fredrik Hallgren, Valery Khartanovich, Aleksandr Khokhlov, Michael Kunst, Pavel Kuznetsov, Harald Meller, Oleg Mochalov, Vayacheslav Moiseyev # et al.

Nature (2015) | doi:10.1038/nature14317 Received 29 December 2014 | Accepted 12 February 2015 | Published online 02 March 2015

Haak *et al.* (2015)

"a steppe origin of at least some of the Indo-European languages of Europe."

GENERATIVISM: RUNNING SCARED?

A fictionalized but familiar conversation ...

"So can you name any real discovery made by generative syntax?"

"How about hierarchical phrase structure, which obeys its own principles but interacts with just about everything else in language?"

"What about case theory and other deep principles that shape the phrases of languages"?

"Or uniform locality conditions that cut across distinct constructions?"

"The discovery in all these areas of a deep unity amidst the diversity of the syntax of the world's languages?"

"Very interesting, but can you name any *real* discovery made by generative syntax?"

LSA, Boston, January 2013, plenary by David Pesetsky (MIT)

"Что дѣлать? What is to be done?"

SCARED OF WHAT?

Evans & Levinson (2009) Behavioral and Brain Sciences

Languages differ so fundamentally from one another at every level of description ... that it is very hard to find any single structural property they share. The claims of Universal Grammar ... are either empirically false, unfalsifiable, or misleading ...



Structural differences should instead be accepted for what they are, and integrated into a new approach to language and cognition that places diversity at centre stage ... Chomsky's notion of Universal Grammar (UG) has been mistaken ... for a set of substantial research findings about what all languages have in common.



cultural evolution is the primary factor that determines linguistic structure....

Bouckaert et al. (2012)

Mapping the Origins and Expansion of the Indo-European Language Family

Remco Bouckaert,¹ Philippe Lemey,² Michael Dunn,^{3,4} Simon J. Greenhill,^{5,6} Alexander V. Alekseyenko,⁷ Alexei J. Drummond,^{1,8} Russell D. Gray,^{5,9} Marc A. Suchard,^{10,11,12} Quentin D. Atkinson^{5,13}*



Science

Gray et al. (2009)

ears Before Present

South-East Asia

Language Phylogenies Reveal Expansion Pulses and Pauses in Pacific Settlement

R. D. Gray,¹ A. J. Drummond,² S. J. Greenhill¹



Japan

aiwán Pause 1

Philippines





Currie et al. (2010)

Rise and fall of political complexity in island South-East Asia and the Pacific

Thomas E. Currie^{1,2}, Simon J. Greenhill^{3,4}, Russell D. Gray³, Toshikazu Hasegawa¹ & Ruth Mace²



Linguistics as a reference framework for human cultural (pre)history?

Forster & Renfrew (2011), Science — geneticist & archaeologist

EVOLUTION

Mother Tongue and Y Chromosomes

A global picture is emerging of sex-specific transmission of language change in quite different regions and continents.

Peter Forster^{1,2} and Colin Renfrew³



Male vs. female lines match differently with language lineages.

IF YOU CAN'T BEAT 'EM, JOIN 'EM?



Meeting Darwin's Last Challenge: Toward a Global Tree of Human Languages and Genes



"gene-language congruence ... by formal syntax ... brought to bear on historical issues."

UNIVERSITY of York

Department of Language and Linguistic Science

- Current partners beyond York are:
- ▶ University of Campinas 🗗 (Brazil)
- University of Pennsylvania 🖻 (USA)



Centre for Linguistic History and Diversity

- Workshop on Language Variation and Change and Cultural Evolution
- > The New Historical Linguistics and the World of Annotated Corpora

FROM LANGUAGES TO HISTORY ... BY NUMBERS?



- At each stage:
 - Concerns, problems, dangers, false analogies.
 - Opportunities, scope for huge advances.



PUTTING MEANINGFUL NUMBERS ON LANGUAGE?

World <u>Atlas</u> of Language Structures — WALS — http://wals.info



Maddieson (2013: WALS 2a): Vowel Quality Inventories

QUANTIFICATION, RULE 1: DO NOT 'BIN' CONTINUOUS DATA



- Consonant: small [6-14] mod. small [15-18] average [19-25] mod. large [26-33] large [34+]
- Tone: no tone simple tone complex tone ...

When $7 = 13 \dots$ But Not 5



- German: 14 =
- Spanish: $5 = \bigcirc$
- Latin: 5 = (5 long + 5 short)
- Italian: 7 = \bigcirc = 5 basic, + / ϵ / /ɔ/ if stressed

•	=		i.e.	7 =	13 =	14
•	¥		ie	7 ≠	5	



 \rightarrow In vowel quality inventory, Italian is represented as ...

- Identical to English, German = most extreme languages in sample.
- Completely different to Spanish, Latin = just on other side of mean (6).

QUALITATIVE OR QUANTITATIVE?

World <u>Atlas</u> of Language Structures — wals — http://wals.info



Comrie (2013: WALS 98a): Alignment of Case Marking of Full Noun Phrases

PUTTING MEANINGFUL 'NUMBERS' ON LANGUAGE

 \uparrow

'Qualitative' justification ('personal a')...

... but 'anti-quantitative':

A. The policy that has been followed in assigning such languages to types has been to maximize the occurrence of overt case marking. Thus, if a language has an optional accusative case marker, or one that occurs only under certain specified circumstances, then this has been given priority and taken as critical. This policy decision needs to be taken into account consistently in interpreting the maps ... Thus, Spanish and Burmese come out as accusative, Araona and Gooniyandi as ergative, and Hindi as tripartite.

- "Maximise ... priority ... critical" \rightarrow
 - AII =. Any =. Any = all.
 - -0.01 is closer to 1 than to 0. 0.01 is 1. 1% = 100%.

QUALITATIVE OR QUANTITATIVE?

- An <u>atlas</u> for display purposes (APiCS too) ...
- ... but being used as a <u>database</u> for quantitative purposes.
- Other issues:
 - (Mis)used for inferences about genealogy ...
 - ... but WALS 'families' very controversial:
 - e.g. *Khoisan, *Altaic, *Australian, *Nilo-Saharan, etc...
 - Coverage of languages sparse (avg. under 3%) and inconsistent.
- We need new databases dedicated for quantitative uses.
- Qualitative *or* quantitative? "It doesn't have to be this way ..."

New DATABASES: QUALITATIVE AND QUANTITATIVE

GLOTTOBANK: world-scale databases, specifically for quantitative applications...

- GRAMBANK
- LEXIBANK
- PHONOBANK
- IELEX and URALEX
- Syncretism in paradigms

Harald Hammarström, Hedvig Skirgård Simon Greenhill Mattis List Michael Dunn Nick Evans

STAGE 2: CRUNCHING THE NUMBERS

TOOLS & MODELS STATISTICS & PHYLOGENETICS

CLIMBING DOWN FROM THE TREES?

- Being led by the tools and models?
- Tree idealisation: a concern with new phylogenetic models?
- Far more of a problem for *traditional* historical linguistics... *e.g.* Best-researched 'LOL' families in world: agreed trees?

• Wild goose chase: <u>no</u> tree reflects historical realities of speaker populations.

THE TREE MODEL VS. REAL POPULATION HISTORY ...

- Human societies do not live ('evolve') only in binary branching relationships.
- So nor do their languages. (Cause-and-effect relationship.)

- Alex François (Société Linguistique de Paris, 17th January 2015).
 - Exploding a myth: Comparative Method \neq Trees!
 - It's precisely the comparative method that confirms data not tree-like!

HISTORIES NOT TREE-LIKE: A NEGLIGIBLE FRUSTRATION?

Indic, Arabic, 'Chinese', Bantu, Mayan, Quechua, Algonquian, Italy, Scandinavia, Switzerland — formerly much more of Europe ...

BAYESIANISM: HANDLING AND MEASURING UNCERTAINTY

Bouckaert (2015, last Friday)

Ringe et al. (2002)

'Distribution' of Indo-European phylogenies

Figure 8. One of the best trees with Germanic omitted.

single 'perfect phylogeny' (no Germanic!)

Which is more realistic?

Gray & Atkinson (2003)

• Time range of farming not Steppe hypothesis.

STAGE 3: INTERPRETATION

FROM DATA ANALYSES TO HUMAN (PRE)HISTORY

INTERPRETATION THROUGH VISUALISATION TOOLS

Brown, C.H. 2013. Finger and hand.

in M. S. Dryer & M. Haspelmath (eds) *The World Atlas of Language Structures Online*, Leipzig: Max Planck Institute for Evolutionary Anthropology. http://wals.info/chapter/130

- Languages with no data not shown.
- Mercator = area distorting projection, which ...

... "SHOULD NEVER BE USED FOR DENSITY VISUALISATION PURPOSES"

Moran, S. & McNew, G. (2015) Visualizing WALS data. Workshop on *Language Comparison with Linguistic Databases*, MPI-EVA, Leipzig, 2015 04 30.

- Eckert IV equal area projection, buffered Thiessen Tessellation.
- Languages with no data all included and shown as such.

INTERPRETING STATISTICS: ANYONE FOR FISHING?

Everett (2013):

Evidence for direct geographic influences on linguistic sounds: the case of ejectives

"62% of languages with ejectives are located in high elevation 'zones', which are defined here as major regions greater than 1500 m in altitude, plus land within 200 km of such a region"

Chen (2013):

The effect of language on economic behavior: evidence from savings rates, health behaviors, and retirement assets.

"Lies, damned lies, and statistics."

PATTERNS IN LANGUAGE DIVERSITY: NOT JUST FAMILIES

Traditional 'family preference', especially for work on prehistory, but ...

.... linguistics has far more to say on human origins and interactions. Patterns on all other 'diversity dimensions' of linguistic panorama. DADDY, WHERE DO LINGUISTIC AREAS COME FROM?

General principle: linguistic effects \leftarrow real-world causes.

LANGUAGE FAMILIES \leftarrow expansive, divergent processes

LINGUISTIC AREAS \leftarrow convergent processes.

Clear-cut: Member of family, yes or no? Diffuse: core vs. peripheral members.

PATTERNS AND CAUSATION: THE CASE OF "ALTAIC"

- CORE VS. PERIPHERY
 Altai vs. Uralic, Korean, Japanese
 Pattern typical of convergence areas.
- 'Mobility', nomadism, very low density …
 → Family 'spread zone' (→ divergence)?

 $Or \rightarrow Intense \ long-range \ contact \rightarrow \underline{convergence}$ (Steppe 'confederations').

■ A diverging 'Altaic' family. ■ A North Eurasian convergence area.

PATTERNS ON DIFFERENT DIMENSIONS: OVERLAPS & CONTRASTS <u>Divergent Language Families</u> — Linguistic <u>Convergence Areas</u>

↑ Güldemann (2010):

"Sprachraum" and geography: linguistic macro-areas in Africa

LANGUAGE STRUCTURES AND THE HOLY GRAIL

• 'Ultra-stable' structures / parameters \rightarrow reveal deepest families, prehistory?

WHEN STRUCTURES ARE MORE STABLE THAN *FAMILIES.* MASS LANGUAGE SHIFT

The <u>same</u> deep structural features:

- Resistant to internal change:
 - = Genealogically most stable.
 - So long as transmission is normal ...
- Resistant even through language shift:
 - \rightarrow Carried over into new language:
 - = Genealogically <u>least</u> stable.
 - = 'Stable' in speaker population, even when they <u>switch</u> genealogy.

• Features so stable structurally that they are <u>un</u>stable 'genealogically'...

 \rightarrow Less diagnostic of deep genealogy than 'Austronesian' lexis!

WELCOME TO THE 'NEW LINGUISTICS'

- 1. New databases ('GlottoBank'):
 - World-scale, fullest coverage.
 - Specifically for quantitative uses.
- 2. New 'number-crunching' models and analyses:
 - Constantly refined to get closer to modelling how *languages* behave.
- 3. New cross-disciplinary scope and co-operation:
 - Ancient DNA, archaeological science...

Some papers on some of these themes: http://eva-mpg.academia.edu/PaulHeggarty

Paul.Heggarty@gmail.com

References

- Atkinson, Q.D. 2011. Phonemic diversity supports a serial founder effect model of language expansion from Africa. *Science* 332(6027): p.346–349. http://dx.doi.org/10.1126/science.1199295
- Balaresque, P., Bowden, G.R., Adams, S.M., Leung, H.-Y., King, T.E., Rosser, Z.H., Goodwin, J., Moisan, J.-P., Richard, C., Millward, A., Demaine, A.G., Barbujani, G., Previderè, C., Wilson, I.J., Tyler-Smith, C., et al. 2010. A predominantly Neolithic origin for European paternal lineages. *PLoS Biology* 8(1): p.e1000285. http://dx.doi.org/10.1371/journal.pbio.1000285
- Bouckaert, R., Lemey, P., Dunn, M., Greenhill, S.J., Alekseyenko, A.V., Drummond, A.J., Gray, R.D., Suchard, M.A., & Atkinson, Q.D. 2012. Mapping the origins and expansion of the Indo-European language family. *Science* 337(6097): p.957–960. http://dx.doi.org/10.1126/science.1219669
- Chen, M.K. 2013. The effect of language on economic behavior: evidence from savings rates, health behaviors, and retirement assets. *The American Economic Review* 103(2): p.690–731. http://dx.doi.org/10.1257/aer.103.2.690
- Comrie, B. 2013. Alignment of case marking of full noun phrases. In M. S. Dryer & M. Haspelmath (eds) *The World Atlas of Language Structures Online*, Leipzig: Max Planck Institute for Evolutionary Anthropology. http://wals.info/chapter/98

Creanza, N., Ruhlen, M., Pemberton, T.J., Rosenberg, N.A., Feldman, M.W., & Ramachandran, S. 2015. A comparison of worldwide phonemic and genetic variation in human populations. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 112(5): p.1265–1272. http://dx.doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1424033112

- Currie, T.E., Greenhill, S.J., Gray, R.D., Hasegawa, T., & Mace, R. 2010. Rise and fall of political complexity in island South-East Asia and the Pacific. *Nature* 467(7317): p.801–804. http://dx.doi.org/10.1038/nature09461
- Cysouw, M., Dediu, D., & Moran, S. 2012. Comment on: "Phonemic diversity supports a serial founder effect model of language expansion from Africa." *Science* 335(6069): p.657. http://dx.doi.org/10.1126/science.1208841
- D'Altroy, T.N. 2014. *The Incas* 2nd ed. Oxford: Wiley-Blackwell. http://eu.wiley.com/WileyCDA/WileyTitle/productCd-1444331159.html
- Donohue, M., & Denham, T. 2010. Farming and language in Island Southeast Asia: reframing Austronesian history. *Current Anthropology* 51(2): p.223–256. http://dx.doi.org/10.1086/650991
- Dunn, M., Greenhill, S.J., Levinson, S.C., & Gray, R.D. 2011. Evolved structure of language shows lineage-specific trends in word-order universals. *Nature* 473(7345): p.79–82. http://dx.doi.org/nature09923
- Evans, N., & Levinson, S.C. 2009. The myth of language universals: Language diversity and its importance for cognitive science. *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* 32(05): p.429–448. http://dx.doi.org/10.1017/S0140525X0999094X

- Everett, C. 2013. Evidence for Direct Geographic Influences on Linguistic Sounds: The Case of Ejectives. *PLoS ONE* 8(6): p.e65275. http://dx.doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0065275
- Everett, C., Blasi, D.E., & Roberts, S.G. 2015. Climate, vocal folds, and tonal languages: Connecting the physiological and geographic dots. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 112(5): p.1322–1327. http://dx.doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1417413112
- Forster, P., & Renfrew, C. 2011. Mother tongue and Y chromosomes. *Science* 333: p.1390–1391. http://dx.doi.org/10.1126/science.1205331
- Gray, R.D., & Atkinson, Q.D. 2003. Language-tree divergence times support the Anatolian theory of Indo-European origin. *Nature* 426(6965): p.435–439. http://dx.doi.org/10.1038/nature02029
- Gray, R.D., Drummond, A.J., & Greenhill, S.J. 2009. Language phylogenies reveal expansion pulses and pauses in Pacific settlement. *Science* 323(5913): p.479. http://dx.doi.org/10.1126/science.1166858
- Güldemann, T. 2010. "Sprachraum" and geography: linguistic macro-areas in Africa. In A. Lameli, R. Kehrein, & S. Rabanus (eds) *Language and Space, Volume 2: Language Mapping*. Handbooks of Linguistics and Communication Science, 561–585. Berlin: Mouton de Gruyter

- Haak, W., Balanovsky, O., Sanchez, J.J., Koshel, S., Zaporozhchenko, V., Adler, C.J., Der Sarkissian, C.S.I., Brandt, G., Schwarz, C., Nicklisch, N., Dresely, V., Fritsch, B., Balanovska, E., Villems, R., Meller, H., et al. 2010. Ancient DNA from European Early Neolithic farmers reveals their Near Eastern affinities. *PLoS Biology* 8(11): p.e1000536. http://dx.doi.org/10.1371/journal.pbio.1000536
- Haak, W., Lazaridis, I., Patterson, N., Rohland, N., Mallick, S., Llamas, B., Brandt, G., Nordenfelt, S., Harney, E., Stewardson, K., Fu, Q., Mittnik, A., Bánffy, E., Economou, C., Francken, M., et al. 2015. Massive migration from the steppe was a source for Indo-European languages in Europe. *Nature* advance online publication. http://dx.doi.org/10.1038/nature14317
- Haspelmath, M., Dryer, M.S., Gil, D., & Comrie, B. eds. 2008. *The World Atlas of Language Structures*. Munich: Max Planck Digital Library. http://wals.info
- Haspelmath, M., & the APiCS Consortium. 2013. Interrogative pronouns. In S. M. Michaelis, P. Maurer, M. Haspelmath, & M. Huber (eds) *Atlas of Pidgin and Creole Language Structures Online*, Leipzig: Max Planck Institute for Evolutionary Anthropology. http://apics-online.info/parameters/19
- Heggarty, P. 2014. Prehistory through language and archaeology. In C. Bowern & B. Evans (eds) *Routledge Handbook of Historical Linguistics*, 598–626. London: Routledge. www.routledge.com/books/details/9780415527897

- Heggarty, P., & Renfrew, C. 2014. Introduction: Languages. In C. Renfrew & P. Bahn (eds) *The Cambridge World Prehistory*, 19–44. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. www.cambridge.org/ec/academic/subjects/archaeology/prehistory/cambridge-world-prehistory
- Maddieson, I. 2013. Vowel quality inventories. In M. S. Dryer & M. Haspelmath (eds) *The World Atlas of Language Structures Online*, Leipzig: Max Planck Institute for Evolutionary Anthropology. http://wals.info/chapter/2
- Matisoff, J.A. 1990. On megalocomparison. *Language* 66(1): p.106–120. http://dx.doi.org/10.2307/415281